

TIMOR-LESTE – PORTUGAL COOPERATION PROGRAM EVALUATION (2011-2017)

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

2018

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The **subject** of the evaluation was the Portuguese Cooperation with Timor-Leste during the period 2011-2017, which includes: the Addendum (2011-2013) to the previous Indicative Programme (PIC) (EUR 48 million) and bilateral ODA — implementing the Strategic Cooperation Programme (PEC) 2014-2017 (EUR 42 million indicative — implemented by 2016: EUR 38 million).

The evaluation **aims** the analysis of the process of elaboration and implementation of the Programme and the performance of the various players in the Portuguese Cooperation for the development of Timor-Leste, and produce recommendations which would contribute to an improvement in the next programming cycle.

As regards the **scope**, the evaluation is structured into three levels of analysis:

- Overall assessment of the strategic orientation and the processes of programming, follow-up and implementation in the framework of development cooperation with East Timor;
- Analysis of the area of intervention and more structuring in terms of financial volume bilateral ODA — Portuguese Language Education and — with focus on results/effects, ownership and sustainability;
- Selective examination of other policy areas, which they consider relevant.

The **conclusions** are the following:

- Portuguese Cooperation was relevant, aligned with the Strategic Development Programme for Timor-Leste (2011-2030).
- Between 2011 and 2017 there was a redefinition of the Portuguese Cooperation in Timor-Leste, with reduced amounts of ODA, with increasing concentration in the education sector and a sharp cut-off in the Cluster, not allowing the implementation of an exit strategy. The other change was affixed to the implementation of delegated cooperation projects, especially in the area of

governance as a way to mitigate the cutting of bilateral funding.

- There was a growing sense of responsibility on the part of Timor-Leste in financial education, governance and social protection/security.
- Problems remain with coordination both in Timor-Leste, both in Portuguese Cooperation with great room for improvement. Also at the level of complementarity, gaps have been identified in particular between interventions in the sector of education, designed in isolation, without any strategic vision.
- In the allocation of resources, both human and financial, some problems of efficiency, with emphasis on the interventions in the education sector. The decision-making procedures, very centralised in Lisbon, with little autonomy, led in some cases to delays in the implementation of the interventions.
- It could be said that the Portuguese Cooperation, though with shortcomings, Timor-Leste has contributed to achieving some of the targets to which they had proposed in the education sector with the CAFE shows better results. The promotion of the Portuguese language projects qualitative progress in CAFE and Consultório da Língua. Interventions in the education sector are aligned with the education policy of Timor-Leste, underlying the guidelines laid down by country.
- The implementation of a new curriculum in primary education has contributed to some instability, in particular as regards the role of languages of instruction and independent evaluation further to the identification of positive factors and consolidation of the curriculum.
- In the CAFE project, although teachers Timorese consider generally that need further training in Portuguese and benefit from increased exposure to the language by daily contact and interaction with Portuguese teachers, teacher training implemented so far does not provide a satisfactory response, but

require more formalised planning and continuity, are not exclusively provided by teachers with preparation for the teaching of Portuguese or sensitive to the specificity of the teaching of a language other than the mother tongue.

- The recruitment of new teachers, which seems to be easier in the context of CAFE school, where teachers who end their traineeship have more chances as tenured teachers in mainstream schools remains a critical factor, posing the risk of allowing entry into the system of qualified teachers in a context where the generational renewal of teachers shall be a relevant issue. This problem is even more relevance in the context of secondary schools.
- The contribution to a stable framework of teaching staff able and is:
 - ✓ at the level of pre-school education, 1st, 2nd and 3rd cycles (CAFE), a close and permanent contact with empowerment, albeit slowly evolved as regards the number of teachers involved;
 - ✓ secondary level of education (Formar Mais), an empowerment, although covering a higher number of teachers, contact time for systematic monitoring and development of professional skills; not perceive satisfactory results in the training of teachers of various subjects of Secondary Education, which will not be unconnected with the model is being implemented, which implies a reduced presence of trainers that level of school education (2 months) and not returned, significantly limiting the potential effects of the training of teachers;
 - ✓ tertiary education (UNTL), work is still low, with little exploration (experimental situations), yet co-teaching between Portuguese teachers and Timor-Leste, aiming to enhance the empowerment of teachers Timor-Leste. There were also a number of requests for internal and external training in the Portuguese language very high for the human resources that the project provides and which generate a large spread, quality and effectiveness of some of these replies.
- Timor-Leste is a country with only 15 years, enabling the massive needs in all areas of the State, since the establishment of the legal frameworks and institutions by the regulators of both general and specialist training of human resources. The model of capacity development implemented by Portuguese Cooperation component is based on an excessive advisories and specialised technical assistance and faces many difficulties in transfer of knowledge and skills due to deficiencies in training human resources base Timor-Leste. This leads to the paradoxical effect of accentuating the already excessive dependence of advisories and technical assistance as well as the slow process of ownership and autonomy. A number of difficulties remain in the ownership of the interventions in all sectors and sustainability issues, mainly at the level of technical and institutional sustainability.
- The contribution to institutional capacity-building in the justice sector, there is a consistent, albeit slow empowerment and characterised by ownership and sustainability problems due to language or the basic training of Timorese frameworks.
- The contribution to the institutional capacity in the protection and social security is very robust and has increasingly been appropriate and sustained, revealing a lower degree of dependency.
- For its part, the contribution to the institutional capacity in the rural development sector has been inconsistent in large part due to several organisational changes in MAP-TL during the reporting period which has not contributed to consolidating the results. Also within the empowerment of rural communities encountered resistance in the adoption of new agricultural and forestry production practices. The model of economic rationality resistance is introduced by interventions in rural communities and requires an adaptive strategy to demonstrate the potential benefits to new generations of farmers.
- The implementation of delegated cooperation, the challenges facing the

Portuguese Cooperation are similar to those of the bilateral cooperation, including the difficulty of promoting ownership and sustainability. In addition, further difficulties linked with excessive bureaucracy and complex processes and which is not incompatible with the high turnover of human resources in headquarters and the excessive centralisation of the decisions in Lisbon and the absence of integrated management systems and information.

Taking into account the findings, the following **recommendations** were made:

- **Recommendation 1.** In view of the problems identified at the level of monitoring, Timor-Leste and Portugal shall establish together the monitoring model of the Portuguese Cooperation, which they deem most appropriate, without losing sight of the need to focus on results. On the one hand, a more active role of MNEC-TL as coordinator of Timor-Leste. On the other hand, Portugal shall allow a higher degree of discretion, for instance by giving more autonomy. Cooperation Attaché The rapid response of the head office (Lisbon — Camões and sectoral) should also be taken into consideration that the efficiency of the aid should be maximised.
- **Recommendation 2.** Whereas the education sector, it is recommended to develop a strategic vision to ensure a significant contribution from Portugal for the qualification of the educational system in Timor-Leste, chiefly raising proficiency in English of its operators, bearing in mind the relevant intervention at different levels of education, from pre-school to higher education, specific purposes, enhancing cooperation and complementarity of interventions. Greater coordination at the level of coordination with projects of the Portuguese Embassy as well as the Timorese structures, but also of the Portuguese part, between the Ministry of Education and the Camões, I.P. in order to find synergies and generate more efficient, avoiding overlap of projects in the same school levels.
- **Recommendation 3.** Whereas the allocation of resources as regards financial resources, efforts should be made so that there are no delays in the payment of salaries. With regard to human resources, a better management of needs, not only at the level of definition of profiles for selection of cooperation actors, and for coordination and for teaching in selection procedures and involving all partners but also avoiding delays in making, either in anticipation or selection, recruitment, creating pockets of need lengthy administrative requirements.
- **Recommendation 4.** With a view to improving the quality of education in the broader framework of valorisation of the teaching career, it is recommended to establish a system of continuous training for teachers and that it contributes to career advancement in the teaching profession. This system should be aligned with the objectives of national educational policy, geared to improving the quality of teacher performance, focusing on the priorities identified in schools and professional development. Shall allow, among others, to: (I) the accreditation of training providers; (II) priority areas for training; (III) the certification of training; (IV) the evaluation and monitoring of training; (v) development of continuing training in the teaching career.
- **Recommendation 5.** With a view to the stabilisation of teaching staff in public schools, recommended planning and procurement procedures, Timor-Leste, allowing, in close liaison with the initial training of teachers, contribute to the renewal of the teaching staff and an effective response to the needs identified in the education system.
- **Recommendation 6.** Whereas the skills of reading constitute a tool plural access to knowledge and cultural enrichment, and it is necessary to broaden and deepen reading habits in the English language, the implementation of measures, including: (I) the creation of a network of libraries; (II) the appropriate equipment with titles in English; (III) facilitating the promotion of reading.

- **Recommendation 7.** With a view to enhancing the recognition and accreditation of communicative skills training in the Portuguese language, it is recommended that power centralisation of external evaluation in UNTL, developing a programme of technical capacity building, in conjunction with the Camões, I.P., to ensure the fulfilment of this function with high quality and reliability.
- **Recommendation 8.** Taking into account the importance of pre-school education for the development of apprenticeships, as well as fundamental for the development of values and attitudes to learning, structuring future involvement on the part of the Portuguese Cooperation projects at this level, enhancing the development of the spoken word in the English language, as a key instrument of expression and communication that the child goes to progressively enlarging and mastering as well as facilitating early contact with the emerging written language.
- **Recommendation 9.** Having regard to the intervention of the pre-primary level 1, 2 and 3 cycles basic education, it is recommended a closer articulation of the Portuguese Ministry of Education with the Camões, I.P. and the Embassy, and consolidating the CAFE project at the level of intervention in the 3rd cycle and strengthening pre-primary level before a possible extension of this project to other levels of education or other geographies. It will need to rethink the training strand of the project, having regard to the empowerment of teachers of Timor-Leste, and moving towards a model that includes the management of schools and teachers with Timor-Leste to play such a role.
- **Recommendation 10.** Having regard to the intervention of the Secondary Education level it is recommended to rethink the design of projects at this level, in view of reinforcing the largest number of trainers for on-call time in schools; and development of joint teams of trainers, enabling the classification of Timorese trainers.
- **Recommendation 11.** Bearing in mind the need to allocate appropriate teaching materials for educational support for apprenticeships, recommended greater coordination in their production and distribution, maximizing the roles available, such as the Ministry of Education of Timor-Leste, as well as continuous improvement of existing materials, in view of, inter alia, the suitability of the profile for language learners.
- **Recommendation 12.** In view of the objective of improving the quality of education and training provided in the framework of education projects, promoting continuous training throughout the project cycle, of teachers and trainers in Portugal in person and/or distance education, strengthening the powers of your second language and in multilingual settings. Accordingly should be promoted during exchanges between teachers/trainers for the various projects, creating networks, synergies between projects and experience sharing methodological and knowledge.
- **Recommendation 13.** Bearing in mind the existence of an element of the Portuguese language on cooperation projects in technical areas, it is recommended the adoption of a methodology, based on best practices, to ensure in advance the trainees language proficiency in English (level B1/B2) positioning, allowing them to understand the content, interact with the trainers and technical skills required. This process, which should precede the technical training courses, involves the following stages: (I) diagnosis of language skills, with measurement of the level of proficiency of the trainees with a view to their placing in relevant courses; (II) in the provision of Portuguese courses for specific purposes, with educational materials produced by teams of specialists in Portuguese and in their technical areas; (III) certification of language proficiency at the end of the courses, the development of professional language skills in English.
- **Recommendation 14.** Taking into account the relevance of the justice sector, strengthen the bilateral support to this sector. Improve the effectiveness of training methodologies and empowerment, allowing better results at the level of ownership and transfer of skills

and knowledge, and in this way contribute to the progressive autonomy of legal practitioners in Timor-Leste.

- **Recommendation 15.** Promote coordination and joint monitoring by DG Justice of Portugal and Timor-Leste. Continue to support higher education, initial and continuous training of legal practitioners. Review the support in English addressed in the legal field. Define a suitable solution for the teaching of Portuguese Legal and Judicial Training Centre, with the support of Camões, I.P. and the Faculty of Law/CEJ-PT UNTL.
- **Recommendation 16.** Should the decision be taken to continue the Fifth Portugal, should be studied in the positioning of the Portuguese Cooperation in view of the multitude of development partners in the agricultural and agro-forestry sectors, and define a strategy geared towards training and the profitability of the investment and its

sustainability. Enhance the co-responsibility and ownership by the Ministry of Agriculture and Fisheries of Timor-Leste.

- **Recommendation 17.** With a view to the ownership and sustainability of projects, exit strategies should be defined, properly combined with the Timorese authorities, to consolidate the results of development in the medium and long term.
- **Recommendation 18.** In view of the increasing importance of delegated cooperation, to make more transparent the chain of links to the Timorese authorities understand clearly the rationale, objectives and functioning of this form of development support. The merits of delegated cooperation must not lead to disinvestment in bilateral cooperation, the capital gains recognised by Portuguese Cooperation in the central areas of governance and the rule of law.